

<https://doi.org/10.34142/2709-7986.2023.28.2.07>

DEVELOPMENT OF EUROPEAN EDUCATIONAL POLICY: LEGAL FOUNDATIONS

Received: 28/07/2023

Accepted: 26/08/2023

**Liudmyla HOLUBNYCHA¹, Tetiana BESARAB²,
& Olena MOSHYNSKA³**



¹ Doctor of Science (Pedagogy), Ph.D., Full Professor, Department of Foreign Languages, Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University, Kharkiv, Ukraine.

✉ E-Mail: golubnichaya11@gmail.com

ORCID <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-8252-9893>



² Ph.D., Associate Professor, Department of Foreign Languages, Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University, Kharkiv, Ukraine.

✉ E-Mail: besarabtp73@gmail.com

ORCID <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-3667-3886>



³ Ph.D., Associate Professor, Department of Foreign Languages, Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University, Kharkiv, Ukraine.

✉ E-Mail: moshaelena1@ukr.net

ORCID <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6652-8674>

ABSTRACT

The manuscript is devoted to European educational policy through the prism of legal regulations as their influence is very significant for the development of educational system especially at the tertiary level.

© Liudmyla HOLUBNYCHA, Tetiana BESARAB, & Olena Moshynska, 2023

Development of European Educational Policy: Legal Foundations © 2023 by Liudmyla HOLUBNYCHA, Tetiana BESARAB, & Olena MOSHYNSKA is licensed under **Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International**. To view a copy of the license, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

The **purpose** is to study peculiarities of the shaping and development of European educational policies within the realm of higher education, where legal and pedagogical sciences intersect. The tasks are: to find out what place educational sector takes in Europe and why; to reveal the most significant legal documents in the sphere of education and follow the path of development of European policy development in the higher education domain by drawing insights from these documents; to determine the value of legal documents in the sphere of education for the development of European educational policy, based on their essence.

The research **methods** used are analysis and syntheses of European legal documents related to the higher education field aimed at collecting the materials for researching the problem both from a legal and pedagogical position and for drawing the conclusion.

The **results** revealed that the beginning of the European countries' cooperation in educational sphere (1970s) led to the development of a common educational strategy. Enhanced collaboration in higher education across various tiers evolved significantly following the recognition of the pivotal role played by skilled human resources in driving economic and social progress, a realization that first emerged in 1985. This recognition led to the endorsement of several significant agreements, including the Single European Act in 1987, the Magna Charta Universitatum in 1988, and the Memorandum of Higher Education in the European Community in 1991. The most important EU Treaties concerned the educational sector as well that led to the signing the Bologna Declaration, the establishment of the European Higher Education Area, and the regular meetings of the European Ministers of Education. Education has become the basis for shaping European community and the core for economic stability.

The **conclusion** is that European statesmen consider the educational sector to be the key one because it is the basis of economic, social and human development; the EU Higher Educational Policy has gone from the auxiliary industry in the context of shaping the internal market (1950s) to one of the priority sectors that is developing in response to the demands of society.

KEYWORDS: European Educational Policy, Educational Strategy, Educational Sector, Education, Legal Regulations.

INTRODUCTION

Throughout history, the development of education took place in parallel with the evolution of human civilization. Leading countries of the world have always had an advanced educational system. Understanding the special role of higher education for achieving shared ambitions has been characteristic of European society since the first attempts to unify the partnership in the region. Today, elevating higher education stands as a top priority for European nations, in particular in the European Union (hereinafter – the EU).

Among its many activities, higher education constitutes a pivotal domain within the EU's policy framework since it directly contributes to European economic growth.

Hence, the EU is deeply invested in advancing the quality of education through every available means (Chorny et al., 2022), regardless of the challenges encountered by European nations (Holubnycha et al., 2022; Kostikova et al., 2023) and the EU in every way encourages cooperation between its Member-States and supports them in developing the European Higher Education Area, constantly working on clarifying and detailing the strategy for achieving it, its main objectives and standards, fixing the solution of problems, connected with the system of higher education, at different levels including the legislative one.

Paying attention to the current legal regulation of the educational process at the tertiary level, we consider it significant to mention the actions of the EU in this area that are aimed at different aspects, in particular:

- developing a European dimension in higher education; increasing the effectiveness of the functioning of the Member-States educational systems and the international attractiveness of higher education in Europe;
- support for the mobility of students and teachers by encouraging them, in particular, the provision of educational grants, academic recognition of diplomas and periods of study;
- modernization of the agenda of higher education (curricula, management and financing); promotion of cooperation between educational institutions;
- the development of the sharing of information and experiences related to shared educational system issues among Member States;
- promoting the growth of remote learning opportunities; partnership with enterprises through implementation of mobility programs for young professionals, etc.

The impact of legislative policy is highly consequential for the advancement of the educational system, particularly at the tertiary level. This policy plays a pivotal role in shaping educational content, curricula, quality standards, and even instructional approaches (Holubnycha, 2015; Holubnycha & Trotsko, 2017). So, research in the stated sphere is really topical.

What is more, the examination of the legal underpinnings of the European higher educational system can be considered relevant not only for educational community but also for legal scholars.

Considering Ukraine as an example, the nation actively engages in the Bologna Process and is a participant in the European Higher Education Area (EHEA). Additionally, Ukraine has previously endorsed the European Cultural Convention through the Council of Europe. Furthermore, it has enshrined a European development orientation in its constitutional framework (Krayevska, 2011).

Therefore, the analysis of this problem is important when assessing the present status of international collaboration in the education sector, and for determining the prospects for further development of the country in this area.

Analysis of research shows that there are a lot of manuscripts devoted to the issue of European educational policy and the development of its normative background. So, Alexiadou (2007), Ertl (2003), Fredriksson (2003), Lokshyna (2007), Novoa (2003), Thijs (2008), Vilchynska (2012) delved into the aforementioned issue by examining its periodization and progression.

Notably, Lokshyna (2007) elaborated on the periodization initially proposed by Ertl (2003), which encompassed four distinct phases: I – the inception (1951-1963), II – the foundational (1963-1976), III – the expansive (1976-1992), and IV – the consolidation (since 1992). Lokshyna (2007: 39-57) divided the last into the period of the establishment of a common educational policy (1992-2000) and the period of intensification of international cooperation (since 2000).

Vilchynska's notable contribution in 2012 lies in her identification of not only the developmental phases of EU educational policy but also in her emphasis on the key milestones that have shaped the legal and institutional foundations of European educational policy from 1957 to the present day.

Special attention is paid to different aspects of European legal and regulatory policy in education. Thus, Bloom (2004) and Moutsios (2007) examined its economic potential. Blunkett (2005), Tulasiewicz & Brock (1999), Schriewer (2000) shed light on the social advantages of this policy. Leclercq (2000), Ryba (2000) investigated the challenges associated with the implementation of the relevant legal acts.

The manuscripts of Dovzhenko (2000), Holubnycha (2014), Krayevska (2011), Van der Wendé (2000), Velichko (2004), Zinchenko (2011). From a legal point of view the issue was studied by Kolesnyk (2020), Kovalchuk (2013), Nevara (2016) address the issue of establishing and nurturing the European educational space, which is evolving in tandem with the Bologna Process, with a focus on pedagogical perspectives.

However, it turned out that the process of shaping and evolution of the legal foundations of higher education in the EU have not been explored jointly from a legal and pedagogical point of view in details.

This can be traced even in the analysis of various documents by the scientists and giving them unequal significance. Therefore, in our opinion, it is relevant to highlight the emergence and development of modern European legal and regulatory higher education policy from both legal and pedagogical aspects.

Thus, the **purpose** of the investigation is to study peculiarities of the shaping and development of European educational policies within the realm of higher education, where legal and pedagogical sciences intersect.

The tasks are: 1) to find out what place educational sector takes in Europe and why; 2) to reveal the most significant legal documents in the sphere of education and follow the path of development of European crafting higher education policies based on these documents; 3) to determine the value of legal documents in the sphere of education for the development of European educational policy, basing on their essence.

METHODOLOGY

The manuscript purpose and the mentioned tasks required using methods of general theoretical level, such as the analysis and synthesis of European legal documents related to the higher education field, namely, different Council and Education Ministers' decisions, Recommendations and declarations of the European Parliament and Council, Communiqué of meetings and conferences of European Ministers, Lisbon Convention, Sorbonne Declaration (<https://www.ehea.info/page-sorbonne-declaration-1998>), Bologna Declaration, Magna Charta Universitatum (<http://www.magna-charta.org>) and others.

As well as pedagogical research on the Bologna Process realization in Ukraine, the general principles of higher education systems in European countries, European Higher Education Area's basic approaches and stages. They were needed to collect the materials for researching the problem jointly from a legal and pedagogical position as well as for drawing the conclusion.

Moreover, Chat GPT was used for the selection and analysis of literature.

RESULTS

The educational system of any country, as well as its culture, is a complex and unique phenomenon, since the basis for education is the spiritual and material past and present

of the nation. Accordingly, it is clear that each country has its own peculiarities of the educational system and its organization.

When there appear changes in the educational system, their causes are mostly environmental alterations, for example, state policy and priorities of its development, accession to international organizations and the signing international treaties, industrial development, movements in culture, etc.

Therefore, today, during the reform of higher education, on the one hand, it is vital to preserve the cultural identity of the national educational system; on the other hand, it is necessary to ensure effective international cooperation, to create opportunities for the employment of future university graduates in the European space, and to maintain the competitiveness of higher education institutions internationally. Consequently, there is a question of coordinating the system of higher education at the global level.

In our opinion, signing the first European treaties (although they were not aimed at the educational sphere directly but concerned education for preparing qualified personal for European economy development) can be considered as the first uncertain attempts to create a system for coordinating education in Europe.

The most significant documents are:

- The Treaty establishing the European Coal and Steel Community, Paris (1951). Its article 56 designated funds earmarked for Brussels with the specific purpose of facilitating the professional retraining of workers.
- The Euratom Treaty (1957), which resulted in the establishment of educational institutions, including universities, for the training of qualified specialists (as outlined in Articles 9 and 33).
- The Treaty establishing the European Economic Community, signed in Rome (1957), with Articles 118, 125, and 128 directly addressing the overarching principles governing the implementation of a unified vocational training policy to foster the development of national economies and the common market.

Thus, at the initial stage of European integration, the issues of education have not become systematic yet. However, during the revival of the countries of the European region after the Second World War, there appeared an awareness of the need to unite and cooperate (Dovzhenko, 2000).

Moreover, it was realized that education should play a significant role in achieving such a goal. In this regard, the issue of vocational and higher education began to receive increasing attention and the process of making its normative settlement became obligatory.

During the 1970s a number of specialized organizations were established as well as several vital legal documents being issued:

- in 1971 UNESCO established the International Commission on the Development of Education, with Edgar Faure serving as its chairperson. This commission adopted a resolution concerning the collaboration of European countries in the realm of education (Faure, 1972). Its appearance was caused by joint European problems and goals; the promotion of democracy through education; the opportunity of empowerment for every human being;
- in 1973 the idea of lifelong learning was initiated as an attempt to overcome the problem of countries competitiveness and employment (Janne, 1973);
- in 1974 the Resolution of the Ministers of Education “On Cooperation in Education” was adopted (Resolution, 1974) and the Committee (within European Commission), which included education ministers of all Member-States and representatives of the European Commission was established;

- in 1976 the Committee on Education worked out the program, which was concerned with teaching and research activities, as well as the problems of compilation of documentation and statistics (Resolution, 1976).

Thus, the main achievement of cooperation between European countries was the development of a common educational strategy that was to be implemented in a context of accelerating socio-economic changes in the region.

The next step on the path to European educational integration can be seen the report of the Committee on the concept of “Europe of Nations”, which was presented in March 1985 at a meeting of the European Council.

Its main idea was to emphasize the value of human resources as a leading factor in economic and social growth, focusing on the need to strengthen competencies to enhance the competitiveness of national economies. The report has led to an increase in attention to the problems of education and vocational training in the scale of Europe, in particular, international cooperation.

So, a number of vital documents appeared in the late 1980s (Mikulec, 2023; Single, 1987; Magna, 1988). Moreover, during 1988 the Council of Ministers of Education endorsed a resolution (Resolution, 1988), which consolidated the educational goals and values in the region (such values as democracy, social justice, respect for human rights and strengthening the sense of European identity) as part of youth training for development of the EU.

But one of the most important tools in the sphere under research became The Magna Charta Universitatum (1988) (<http://www.magna-charta.org>).

The next steps in the normative settlement of higher education within Europe took place in the 1990s. Several important regulations (European Commission, 1991; Treaty, 1992; Treaty, 1997; Council, 1997; Sorbonne, 1998) developed standards of the EU tertiary level of education.

In particular, they substantiated the role of qualitative training of specialists for future citizens of the region and further development of the EU (Memorandum, 1991).

The analysis of the most significant legal documents in the sphere of education shows that special value for development of European educational policy may be given to main treaties establishing the EU.

So, under art. 149-150 (Treaty, 1992) the Union received, in accordance with the principle of “subsidiarity”, limited powers in this area, while responsibility for the content and implementation of educational policy remained for the states. The EU’s mandate included supporting Member-States’ actions in certain areas of educational policy and subsidiary activities to enhance the “spirit of European”.

According to Chapter XI, subdivision III (Treaty, 1997) the provision of education was consolidated. So, on the one hand, the document deepened the integration processes in the EU and facilitated the advance of the quality of education, and on the other, it underlined the importance of the diversity of cultures and languages within the Member States.

As the results of some documents (Council, 1997; Sorbonne, 1998) such essential aspects of modern higher educational sphere were developed:

- the creation of a two-level structure of higher education;
- the use of credit systems (ECTS);
- international recognition of a bachelor’s degree as a level of higher education and granting it the right to continue studying for educational programs of a master’s degree.

Stepko et al. (2003) argue that the modernization of higher education took place following the implementation of the Bologna Declaration (1999), which marked the inception of the Bologna Process (1999), officially commencing in the same year.

Thus, the Bologna Process is based on “a structural and paradigmatic reform of higher education in Europe” (the Bologna Process, 1999), with the goal of “convergence of European higher educational systems” (the Bologna Process, 1999: 3).

Following the adoption of the Bologna Declaration, the convergence and internationalization of European educational systems in a single European Educational Area have taken place and the normative regulation of the higher educational process in the EU has become systematic and dynamic.

So, at least every two years there are gatherings of the Education Ministers representing the participating nations till 2010 to clarify and detail the strategies to achieve the EU’s main objectives in educational policy (see Table 1).

Table 1
Legislative Measures Concerning Higher Education in the European Union till 2010

Year	Document Title	Core Content of the Document
2001	Salamanca Declaration “Shaping Our Own Future in the European Higher Education Area” (Salamanca, 2001)	It <i>established</i> the following: 1) fundamental principles for higher education, encompassing autonomy paired with responsibility, education's societal obligation, higher education grounded in scientific research, and structured diversification; 2) focal concerns, which encompassed the quality of higher education, the fostering of trust, alignment with the European labour market, and facilitation of mobility.
2001	Prague communiqué “To the European Higher Education Area” (Bologna, 2001)	It <i>determined</i> : 1) the promotion of European cooperation in ensuring the quality of education; 2) the development of principles, criteria for further development of the quality of educational system, certification of national systems of quality assurance.
2001	Report from the Commission “The concrete future objectives of education system” (Report, 2001)	It <i>determined</i> the Council of Europe's harmonized recommendations for shaping national educational policies in the education domain until 2010, specifically: collaborative initiatives among Member States in the education sphere until 2010; a strategic approach for enhancing the quality and efficiency of education and training systems within EU nations; facilitating access to all forms of education throughout life; increasing the openness of education and training systems around the world.
2002	The Copenhagen Declaration of European Ministers of Vocational Education and Training and European	It <i>determined</i> the policy of international cooperation in the sphere of professional training.

	Commission (The Copenhagen, 2002)	
2003	Berlin Communiqué “Creating a European Higher Education Area” (Bologna, 2003)	It <i>determined</i> : 1) the functions of national systems to ensure the quality of education; 2) internal and external evaluation of educational programmes of higher educational establishments; 3) the responsibilities of institutions that will ensure the quality of education; 4) the procedure of attestation and accreditation
2005	Bergen Communiqué “The European Higher Education Area - Achieving Goals.” (Bologna, 2005)	It <i>determined</i> measures of quality assurance of education: 1) improving the quality of higher education institutions activity by introducing internal quality assurance mechanisms in the context of maintaining the connection with the external quality assurance system; 2) introduction of a model of expert assessment of quality assurance agencies at the domestic level; 3) fostering collaborative efforts with national agencies to ensure educational quality.
2006	Recommendation of the European parliament and of the council on key competences for lifelong learning (Recommendation, 2006)	It <i>determined</i> : 1) recommendations for implementation in the national educational systems of the Member States; 2) key competences encompass: proficiency in native language communication, fluency in a foreign language, mathematical expertise, foundational competence in science and technology, digital literacy, interpersonal abilities, intercultural understanding, social and civic proficiencies, entrepreneurial skills, and cultural expression. A Directory of Quality Assurance Agencies for European Higher Education was created.
2007	London Communiqué “Towards a European Higher Education Area: Answering the Challenges of Globalization” (Bologna, 2007)	It <i>determined</i> a shift towards the issue of international cooperation between quality assurance agencies and the mutual recognition of accreditations.
2009	Leuven / Louvre Communiqué “Bologna Process 2020 – European Higher Education Area in the New Decade” (Leuven, 2009)	It <i>determined</i> : 1) the main achievements of the Bologna process: globalization, rapid development of technologies; 2) the problems to be answered by the higher education system: the aging population, the financial and economic crisis; 3) tasks for the next decade.
2010	Budapest-Vienna Declaration on the	It <i>determined</i> that the problems of providing high-quality higher education are greatly enhanced.

	European Higher Education Area (Bologna, 2010)	The European Higher Education Area was officially proclaimed.
2010	European Cooperation Programme in the field of education and training “ET-2020” (Communication, 2010)	It <i>determined</i> strategic goals of the tertiary level till 2020: 1) providing lifelong education and mobility; 2) enhancing the excellence and effectiveness of education and training; 3) advancement of social cohesion, active civic position; 4) encouraging innovation and creativity at all levels of education and training.

There are meetings of the Education Ministers of the participating countries to widen EU’s main objectives in educational policy. Thus, it is expedient, in our opinion, to present the regulations adopted at that time in the form of a table (see Table 2).

Table 2
Regulatory Acts on Higher Education in the EU till 2023

Year	Document Title	Core Content of the Document
2012	Bucharest Communiqué “Using our potential to the greatest benefit: consolidating the European Higher Education Area” (Bucharest, 2012)	It <i>determined</i> : 1) skills as a component of the strategic goal – improving the quality of education; 2) future priorities for the development of the European Higher Education Area. The results of the Bologna process have been summed up.
2014	The educational programme of international cooperation "Erasmus +" (The educational, 2014)	It <i>determined</i> : 1) general information about the programme; 2) information on the directions and activities of the programme; 3) detailed information on the procedures for submitting a project proposal for a grant and selection of projects; 4) financial and administrative provisions related to the award of the Erasmus + grant.
2015	Yerevan Communiqué (Bologna, 2015)	It <i>determined</i> : 1) the direction for further implementation of the EHEA; 2) progress in the implementation of the priorities of the Bucharest Communiqué; 3) the main priorities of the development of cooperation within the framework of the Bologna Process up to 2018: improvement of the quality and conformity of higher education, readiness of graduates to work; expanding access to higher education in the context of demographic change, migration and military conflicts; introduction of structural reforms in higher education.

	<p>It <i>adopted</i>: 1) new Standards and Recommendations on the quality assurance of higher education in the EHEA, 2) European approaches to quality assurance of joint higher education programmes; 3) a new version of the ECTS user guide.</p>
<p>2018 Paris Communiqué (http://www.ehea2018.paris)</p>	<p>It <i>determined</i>: 1) promoting and safeguarding fundamental values like academic freedom, integrity, institutional autonomy, involving students and staff in higher education governance, and ensuring public accountability within the EHEA; 2) encouraging and aiding higher education institutions in fulfilling their societal role and promoting a more cohesive and inclusive society by fostering intercultural comprehension, civic engagement, ethical consciousness, and equitable access to higher education; 3) progress in implementing agreed reforms.</p>
<p>2020 Rome Ministerial Communiqué (Rome, 2020)</p>	<p>It <i>determined</i>: 1) free movement of academic staff, students and graduates for teaching, learning and doing research; 2) the EHEA respects higher education values, democracy and the rule of law; 3) European higher education strives for inclusive, innovative and incorporated EHEA by 2030; 4) European higher education must prepare active, critical and responsible citizens; 5) European higher education is the key point for sustainable development by 2023; 50 it is important to support not only quality education but also academic and scientific integrity.</p>
<p>2023 G20 Education Ministerial Meeting “Outcome Document and Chair’s Summary” (G20, 2023)</p>	<p>It <i>determined</i>: 1) education is crucial for enabling human dignity as well as self-actualisation globally; 2) coordination of global educational sphere is important for sustainable future; 3) everybody must be admitted to quality, inclusive and equitable teaching and learning; 4) education encompasses not only academic learning but also the cultivation of life skills, technical expertise, and vocational proficiencies, all of which are vital for lifelong development.</p>

Analysis of the table shows that, firstly, since the beginning of the 21st century intensification of international cooperation in the sphere of higher education has occurred; secondly, both official EU’s organs and international organizations concerning higher school pay attention to problems of the establishment and evolution of the European Higher Education Area.

Thirdly, different aspects of higher education are being regulated; fourthly, higher education quality may be considered as the most urgent issue as it has been mentioned more often; fifthly, other frequently and newly regarded problems are fundamental values and competences; sixthly, new strategies of European educational policy have been formed since 2010.

Thus, the increased attention of the international institutions of the EU on the development of the whole educational sphere as a catalyst for the advancement for the development of a competitive European community can be seen.

DISCUSSION

Analysis of studies that are devoted to the issue under research has demonstrated that changes of European education policy attracted attention of a number of scholars. Hence, our complete concurrence with the views of Ertl (2003), Fredriksson (2003), and Kovalchuk (2013), who posit that globalization has exerted a significant influence on European education policy.

But the above authors investigated European education policy more through legal prism. However, we tried to do it through both legal and pedagogical prism.

Simons (2007) is another scholar who delves into the impact of globalization on European education policy. But the researcher also underlines the nation state governments' role. This distinguishes his article from previous ones including ours.

We also fully support the study of Cankaya et al. (2015), where the scholars claim that Europe reflected education as an instrument to reach its economic goals. As the stated authors we paid attention to historical perspective of problem under study. But unlike our research they stood at pedagogical position mostly.

The authors wholeheartedly concur with the assessment of the pivotal role played by the Bologna Process in reshaping the higher education system, as elucidated from a pedagogical perspective by various scholars, including Nevara (2016), Stepko et al. (2003), Van der Wende (2000), Velychko (2004), Zinchenko (2011).

However, all the mentioned scientific investigations were devoted exclusively or mostly to the Bologna Declaration while we considered a rather wide range of legal documents related fully or partly to European educational policy or influenced it greatly or to some extent. Furthermore, those papers did not address the legal aspect, which is of significance for our study.

CONCLUSIONS

Thus, the investigation has enabled us to derive the following conclusions:

- 1) given the EU's ambition to become "the most competitive and dynamic knowledge-based economy in the world", after 2010, European policymakers have increasingly recognized the pivotal role of the education sector within the EU since education serves as the cornerstone for economic, social, and human development;
- 2) the EU's Higher Education Policy has transitioned from being a secondary concern in the context of shaping the internal market during the 1950s to one of the foremost priority sectors, adapting to the evolving needs of society;
- 3) the commencement of collaborative efforts among European countries in the realm of higher education during the 1970s culminated in the formulation of a unified educational strategy.

This strategy encompassed the adoption of initial joint action programs in the domain of higher education and training, accompanied by the establishment of an institutional

framework for their execution; the recognition of the pivotal role played by skilled human resources as the primary driver of economic and social progress in 1985 served to intensify collaboration in higher education.

This collaboration extended beyond the purview of European governing institutions to encompass higher educational institutions.

It gave rise to a proliferation of educational programmes, the establishment of a unified European information and analytical network, the endorsement of the Magna Charta Universitatum by educators in 1988 (<http://www.magna-charta.org>), and, on a legislative front, the enactment of the Single European Act in 1987 and the adoption of the Memorandum of Higher Education in the European Community in 1991 (European Commission, 1991).

The Maastricht Treaty ushered the educational sector into the sphere of the EU's jurisdiction, amalgamating educational objectives with other shared policies of the Union. This evolution led to the endorsement of the Bologna Declaration, the formation of the European Higher Education Area, and the routine convening of European Ministers of Education to elucidate and elaborate on strategies aimed at realizing the principal objectives of the EU's educational policy.

The EU's educational policy, grounded in its founding treaties, strategic development programs for both the Union and its member states, and supplementary documents issued by EU institutions, serves as a foundational pillar for forging the European community.

Simultaneously, it acts as a linchpin for the economic stability and competitiveness of EU nations. Furthermore, this policy has been instrumental in driving substantial educational reforms within the sphere of higher education.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest regarding the publication of this paper.

FUNDING

The authors declare that this study received no specific financial support.

REFERENCES

- Alexiadou, N. (2007). The Europeanisation of Education Policy: Researching Changing Governance and "New" Modes of Coordination. *Research in Comparative and International Education*, 2(2), 102-116. <https://doi.org/10.2304/rcie.2007.2.2.102>
- Bloom, D. E. (2004). Globalization and Education: An Economic Perspective. In M. M. Suárez-Orozco & D. B. Qin-Hilliard (Eds.), *Globalization: Culture and education in the new millennium* (pp. 56-77). University of California Press.
- Blunkett, D. A., & Johnson, A. (2005). *Modern Social Dimension for Europe: Principles for Reform*. London: Cabinet of Ministers.
- Bologna process. (2015). Yerevan Communiqué. http://ipq.org.ua/upload/files/files/03_Novyny/2015.05.15_Ministerial_Conference/Yerevan%20Communique.pdf
- Bologna Secretariat. (2001). *Towards the European Higher Education Area. Communiqué of the meeting of European Ministers in charge of Higher*

- Education in Prague on May 19th 2001.*
https://www.ehea.info/Upload/document/ministerial_declarations/2001_Prague_Communique_English_553442.pdf
- Bologna Secretariat. (2003). *Realising the European Higher Education Area. Communique of the Conference of European Ministers Responsible for Higher Education, Berlin, 19 September 2003.*
https://www.ehea.info/Upload/document/ministerial_declarations/2003_Berlin_Communique_English_577284.pdf
- Bologna Secretariat. (2005). *The European Higher Education Area – Achieving the Goals. Communique of the Conference of European Ministers Responsible for Higher Education, Bergen, 19-20 May 2005.*
https://www.uc.pt/ge3s/pasta_docs/outros_docs/comun_bergen
- Bologna Secretariat. (2007). *Communique of the Conference of European Ministers Responsible for Higher Education, London, 17-18 May 2007.*
https://www.uc.pt/ge3s/pasta_docs/outros_docs/comun_londres
- Bologna Secretariat. (2010). *Communique of the Conference of European Ministers Responsible for Higher Education, Budapest-Vienna, accessed 12 March 2010.*
https://www.ehea.info/Upload/document/ministerial_declarations/Budapest_Vienna_Declaration_598640.pdf
- Bucharest Communiqué. (2012). *Making the Most of Our Potential: Consolidating the European Higher Education Area. Communiqué of the Conference of European Ministers Responsible for Higher education.*
https://www.ehea.info/Upload/document/ministerial_declarations/Bucharest_Communique_2012_610673.pdf
- Cankaya, S., Kutlu, Ö., & Cebeci, E. (2015). The Educational Policy of European Union. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 174, 886-893.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.706>
- Chorny, O., Herasymenko, L., Holubnych, L., Zelenska, L., Dzyna, N., & Tytiuk, V. (2022). Information Technologies for Visualization of Diagnostic Results of Future Engineers Competences in Multidimensional Non-Metric Spaces. *Journal of Theoretical and Applied Information Technology*, 100(20), 5906-5917.
<http://www.jatit.org/volumes/Vol100No20/6Vol100No20.pdf>
- Commission of the European Communities. (2001). *Report from the Commission: “The Concrete Future Objectives of education system”.*
http://www.aic.lv/bologna/Bologna/contrib/EU/concr_obj.pdf
- Council of Europe/UNESCO. (1997). *Lisbon Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region.*
<https://rm.coe.int/168007f2c7>
- Dovzhenko, O.V. (2000). The Sorbonne and Bologna Declarations: Information for reflection. *Bulletin of Higher Education*, 6, 86-91.
- Ertl, H. (2003). The European Union and Education and Training: An Overview of Policies and Initiatives. In D. Phillips, & H. Ertl (Eds.), *Implementing European Union*

- Education and Training Policy: A Comparative Study of Issues in Four Member States* (pp. 13-39). Springer, Dordrecht. https://doi.org/10.1007/0-306-48077-8_2
- European Commission. (1991). *Memorandum on Higher Education in the European Community*. <https://kritischestudentenutrecht.files.wordpress.com/2009/06/ec-memorandum-on-higher-education-1991.pdf>
- European Commission. (2010). *EUROPE 2020 A Strategy for Smart, Sustainable and Inclusive Growth*. EUR-Lex. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/en/ALL/?uri=CELEX%3A52010DC2020>
- Faure, E., Herrera, F., Kaddoura, A-R., Lopes, H., Petrovsky, A. V., & Rahnema, M. (1972) *Learning to Be: The World of Education Today and Tomorrow*. UNESCO. <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000001801>
- Fredriksson, U. (2003). Changes of Education Policies within the European Union in the Light of Globalisation. *European Educational Research Journal*, 2(4), 522-546. <https://doi.org/10.2304/eej.2003.2.4.3>
- G20 Education Ministerial Meeting “Outcome Document and Chair’s Summary”. Pune, India, 22 June 2023. (2023). https://www.g20.org/content/dam/gtwenty/gtwenty_new/document/G20-Education-WG-ODCS-22.pdf
- Holubnycha, L. O. (2014). Higher School Didactics in the 21st Century. *Science and Education a New Dimension: Pedagogy and Psychology*, 11(13)(26), 22-25. https://dspace.nlu.edu.ua/bitstream/123456789/13345/1/Golubnycha_22-25.pdf
- Holubnycha, L. O. (2015). The Influence of Government Policy on Higher Education Issues on the Historiography of University Didactics of the Eastern Ukrainian Region (50s-60s of the 20th century). *Theory and Methods of Teaching and Upbringing*, 37, 11-19. http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/znpkhnpu_ttmniv_2015_37_4
- Holubnycha, L. O., & Trotsko, A. V. (2017). Government Policy on Higher Education and its Influence on the Historiography of Higher Education Didactics in the Eastern Region of Ukraine (70s-80s of the XX Century). *Theory and Methods of Teaching and Upbringing*, 41, 138-148.
- Holubnycha, L., Besarab, T., Pavlishcheva, Ya., Kadaner, O., & Khodakovska O. (2022). E-Learning at the Tertiary Level in and after Pandemic. *Acta Paedagogica Vilnensia*, 48, 47-60. <https://doi.org/10.15388/ActPaed.2022.48.3>
- Janne, H. (Ed.). (1973). *For a Community Policy on Education. Report by. Bulletin of the European Communities. Supplement, October, 10/73*. European Communities Commission. <http://aei.pitt.edu/5588/1/5588.pdf>
- Kolesnyk, V. Yu. (2020). *Legal Basis of EU Education Policy* [PhD Dissertation, National University «Odessa Law Academy» of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine]. National University «Odessa Law Academy» of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine. http://dspace.onua.edu.ua/bitstream/handle/11300/13796/Kolesnyk%20V_Thesis.pdf?sequence=3&isAllowed=y

- Kostikova, I., Holubnycha, L., Marmaza, O., Budianska, V., Pochuieva, O., & Marykivska, H. (2023). Real Country Experiences: On-line Teaching in Wartime after Pandemic in Ukraine. *International Journal of Interactive Mobile Technologies (IJIM)*, 17(03), 123-134. <https://doi.org/10.3991/ijim.v17i03.36419>
- Kovalchuk, O. (2013). Educational Policy of the EU Countries under Globalization and Europeanization. *Scientific Research and Their Practical Application. Modern State and Ways of Development*, October 1-12, 2013. <https://www.sworld.com.ua/konfer32/1059.pdf>
- Kraevska, O. (2011). Educational Policy of the European Union: Shaping and Implementation Mechanisms. *Bulletin of Lviv University. International relations series*, 28, 53-65. http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/VLNU_Mv_2011_28_7
- Leclercq, J.-M. (2000). Strategies for Educational Reform: from Concept to Realization. General Report. In *Strategies for Educational Reform: from Concept to Realization. Symposium, Prague (Czech Republic), 4-6 November, 1999* (pp. 9-24.). Council of Europe Publishing.
- Leuven/Louvain-la-Neuve Communiqué draft 3 of 16/03/2009. (2009). http://www.ehea.info/media.ehea.info/file/20090326-27-Prague/62/1/Draft3_Leuven_LLN_Communique_160309_594621.pdf
- Lokshyna, O. (2007). Stages of the Strategy Development of the European Union in the Field of Education. *Information Technologies and Teaching Aids*, 2(1).
- Mikulec, B. (2023). Teoretski modeli in koncepti vseživljenjskega učenja. In J. L. Vodopivec, & M. Mezgec (Ed.), *Vseživljenjsko učenje odraslih za trajnostni razvoj in digitalni preboj* (pp.11-26). Založba Univerze na Primorskem. <https://doi.org/10.26493/978-961-293-230-5>
- Moutsios, S. (2007). The European Union and its Education Policy. In H.-G. Kotthoff, & S. Moutsios, (Eds.), *Education Policies in Europe: Economy, Citizenship, Diversity* (pp. 15-25). GMBH: Waxmann Verlag.
- Nevara, L. (2016). Decisions of international conferences and organizations in the Bologna process. *International Relations*, 1(44/45), 85-89.
- Novoa, A., & Dejong-Lambert, W. (2003). Educating Europe: An Analysis of EU Educational Policies. In D. Phillips, & H. Ertl (Eds.), *Implementing European Union Education and Training Policy: A Comparative Study of Issues in Four Member States* (pp. 41-72). Springer.
- Recommendation of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2006 on Key Competences for Lifelong Learning. (2006). *Official Journal of the European Union*, L 394, 10-18. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2006:394:0010:0018:en:PDF>
- Regulation (EEC) No 337/75 of the Council of 10 February 1975 establishing a European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training. (1975). <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/1975/337/oj>
- Resolution of the Council and of Ministers of Education, meeting in the Council, of February 9, 1976, Comprising an Action Programme in the Field of Education.

- (1976). *Official Journal of the European Union*, C38, 1-5. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:41976X0219>
- Resolution of the Council and the Ministers of Education meeting within the Council on the European dimension in education of 24 May 1988. (1988). *OJ*, C177, 5-7. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/ALL/?uri=CELEX%3A41988X0706%2801%29>
- Resolution of the Ministers of Education, meeting within the Council, of 6 June 1974 on cooperation in the field of education. (1974). *Official Journal*, C098, 0002-0002. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:41974X0820:EN:HTML>
- Rome Ministerial Communiqué. (2020). *EHEA 2020 Rome Ministerial Conference*. https://www.ehea.info/Upload/Rome_Ministerial_Communique.pdf
- Ryba, R. (2000). Developing the European Dimension in Education. The Roles of the European Union and the Council of Europe. In E. Sherman Swing, J. Schriewer, & F. Orivel (Eds.), *Problems and Prospects of European Education* (pp. 244-261). Greenwood Publishing Group.
- Salamanca Declaration. (2001). <http://accreditation.org/accords/salamanca-declaration-2001>
- Schriewer, J., Orivel, F., & Swing E. S. (2000). European Educational Systems: the Framework of Tradition, Systemic Expansion and Challenges for Restructuring. In E. Sherman Swing, J. Schriewer, & F. Orivel (Eds.), *Problems and Prospects of European Education* (pp. 244-261). Greenwood Publishing Group.
- Simons, M. (2007). Educational policy in a European context: Exploring processes of governmentalisation in Flanders. *Tertium Comparationis Journal für International und Interkulturell Vergleichende Erziehungswissenschaft*, 13(2), 217-233. https://www.waxmann.com/index.php?elD=download&id_artikel=ART100085&uid=frei
- Single European Act. (1987). <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:11986U/TXT&from=EN>
- Stepko, M.F., Bolyubash, Y.Ya., Shynkaruk, V.D., Grubinko, V.V., & Babin, I.I. (Eds.) (2003). *The Bologna process in Facts and Documents (Sorbonne-Bologna-Salamanca-Prague-Berlin)*. Ternopilskyi derzhavnyi pedahohichnyi universytet imeni Volodymyra Hnatiuka <https://studfile.net/preview/7129782/page:12> [in Ukrainian].
- The Bologna Declaration of 19 June 1999. Joint declaration of the European Ministers of Education. (1999). https://www.ehea.info/media.ehea.info/file/Ministerial_conferences/02/8/1999_Bologna_Declaration_English_553028.pdf
- The Bologna Process and the European Higher Education Area*. (1999). http://ec.europa.eu/education/higher-education/bologna_en.html

- The Copenhagen Declaration of European Ministers of Vocational Education and Training and European Commission.* (2002).
https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/files/copenahagen_declaration_en.pdf
- The Council of the European Communities. (1988). *88/348/EEC: Council Decision of 16 June 1988 adopting an action programme for the promotion of youth exchanges in the Community – “Youth for Europe” programme.* EUR-Lex.
<http://data.europa.eu/eli/dec/1988/348/oj>
- The Educational Programme of International Cooperation “Erasmus +”.* (2019).
https://erasmus-plus.ec.europa.eu/sites/default/files/erasmus-plus-programme-guide-2019_en_1.pdf
- The European Higher Education Area. (1999). *Ministerial Conference Bologna 1999.*
<https://www.ehea.info/page-ministerial-conference-bologna-1999>
- Thijs, A., Berthold van Leeuwen, & Zandbergen, M. (2008). *The Development of Education. National Report of the Ministry of Thijs A. Education, Culture and Science.* The Hague: MESOC.
- Treaty Establishing the European Coal and Steel Community. Paris, 18 April 1951. (1951).
<https://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:11951K:EN:PDF>
- Treaty Establishing the European Economic Community. Rome, 25 March 1957. (1957).
https://www.cvce.eu/en/obj/treaty_establishing_the_european_economic_community_rome_25_march_1957-en-cca6ba28-0bf3-4ce6-8a76-6b0b3252696e.html
- Treaty of Amsterdam amending the Treaty of European Union, treaties establishing the European Communities and related acts. Official Journal of the European Union. 10 November 1997. (1997).
- Treaty on European Union. (1992). <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:11992M/TXT>
- Treaty on the European Atomic Energy Community (Euratom). (1957). <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:11957A/TXT>
- Tulasiewicz, W., & Brock, C. (1999). The Place of Education in a United Europe. In C. Brock & W. Tulasiewicz (Eds.), *Education in a Single Europe* (pp. 1-49). Routledge.
- Van Der Wende, M. C. (2000). The Bologna Declaration: Enhancing the Transparency and Competitiveness of European Higher Education. *Higher Education in Europe*, 25(3), 305–310. <https://doi.org/10.1080/713669277>
- Velychko, O.H. (2004). The Bologna Process is Specific Decisions and Actions. *Theory and Practice of Metallurgy*, 1, 3-13.
- Vilchynska, N.Yu. (2012) *The European Union Education Policy and Politics: Features of the Formation and Implementation* [PhD Thesis / Dissertation, National Pedagogical Drahomanov University]. National Pedagogical Drahomanov University.
<https://enpuir.npu.edu.ua/bitstream/handle/123456789/30854/100153959.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>
- Zinchenko, V. (2011). The Quality of Higher Education in the Official Documents of the Bologna group. *Youth and the market*, 11(82), 113-117.

АНОТАЦІЯ / ABSTRACT [in Ukrainian]:

ЄВРОПЕЙСЬКА ОСВІТНЯ ПОЛІТИКА: ПРАВОВІ ЗАСАДИ

Статтю присвячено європейській освітній політиці крізь призму законодавчих норм, оскільки їхній вплив є дуже значним для розвитку системи освіти, особливо на рівні вищої освіти.

Мета – дослідити особливості формування та розвитку європейської освітньої політики у сфері вищої освіти на стику юридичної й педагогічної наук. Завдання: з'ясувати, яке місце займає освітня сфера в Європі і чому; виявити найважливіші нормативно-правові документи у сфері освіти та на основі цих документів прослідкувати шлях розвитку європейської політики у сфері вищої освіти; визначити значення нормативно-правових документів у сфері освіти для розвитку європейської освітньої політики, виходячи з їх сутності.

Методами дослідження є аналіз та узагальнення європейських нормативно-правових документів, що стосуються сфери вищої освіти, з метою збору матеріалів для дослідження проблеми з правової та педагогічної позицій разом та для формування висновків.

Результати показали, що початок співпраці європейських країн в освітній сфері (1970-ті роки) призвів до розробки спільної освітньої стратегії. Співпраця у сфері вищої освіти на різних рівнях була поглиблена після усвідомлення важливості компетентних людських ресурсів як головного чинника економічного та соціального розвитку (1985 р.), що призвело до підписання ряду важливих документів (Єдиний європейський акт, 1987 р.; Велика хартія університетів, 1988 р.; Меморандум про вищу освіту в Європейському співтоваристві, 1991 р.). Найважливіші угоди ЄС також стосувалися освітнього сектору, що призвело до підписання Болонської декларації, створення Європейського простору вищої освіти та регулярних зустрічей європейських міністрів освіти. Освіта стала основою формування європейської спільноти та основою економічної стабільності.

Висновок полягає в тому, що європейські державні діячі вважають освітній сектор ключовим, оскільки він є основою економічного, соціального та людського розвитку; Політика ЄС щодо вищої освіти пройшла шлях від допоміжної галузі в контексті формування внутрішнього ринку (1950-ті роки) до одного з пріоритетних секторів, який розвивається відповідно до запитів суспільства.

КЛЮЧОВІ СЛОВА: Європейська освітня політика, освітня стратегія, освітній сектор, освіта, правове регулювання.

CITE THIS ARTICLE AS (APA style):

Holubnychya, L., Besarab, T., & Moshynska, O. (2023). Development of European Educational Policy: Legal Foundations. *Educational Challenges*, 28(2), 97-114. <https://doi.org/10.34142/2709-7986.2023.28.2.07>

